

Probabilistic Full Abstraction

joint work with **T. Ehrhard** and **M. Pagani**

Christine Tasson

Christine.Tasson@irif.fr

Laboratoire IRIF - Université Paris Diderot

***A denotational semantics for **discrete** probabilistic
higher-order functional computation,
which is **fully abstract*****

(based on **quantitative** semantics)

- ① General framework: Domains vs Quantitative semantics
- ② PCoh: Probabilistic Coherent Spaces
- ③ Probabilistic Call by Name
- ④ Probabilistic Call by Push Value

***A denotational semantics for **discrete** probabilistic
higher-order functional computation,
which is **fully abstract*****

(based on **quantitative** semantics)

- ① **General framework: Domains vs Quantitative semantics**
- ② PCoh: Probabilistic Coherent Spaces
- ③ Probabilistic Call by Name
- ④ Probabilistic Call by Push Value

General Framework	Domains Semantics	Quantitative Semantics
Types	Continuous dcpos (X, \leq)	Proba. spaces $(X , P(X) \subseteq (\mathbb{R}^+)^{ X })$
Programs	Scott Continuous	Analytic Functions
Probability	Proba. monad	Values as proba. distr.

Bibliography

- 1976 Plotkin
- 1981 Kozen
- 1989 Plotkin and Jones
- 1998 Jung and Tix
- 2013 Goubault Larrecq and Varraca
- 2013 Mislove

Bibliography

- 1988 Girard
- 1994 Blute, Panangaden and Seely
- 2002 Hasegawa
- 2004 Girard
- 2011 Danos and Ehrhard
- 2014 Ehrhard, Pagani, T.
- 2016 Ehrhard, T.

General Framework	Domains Semantics	Quantitative Semantics
Types	Continuous dcpos (X, \leq)	Proba. spaces $(X , P(X) \subseteq (\mathbb{R}^+)^{ X })$
Programs	Scott Continuous	Analytic Functions
Probability	Proba. monad	Values as proba. distr.

How to interpret a program $M : \text{nat} \Rightarrow \text{nat}$

Type: \mathbb{N}_\perp flat domain,
 $\mathcal{V}(\mathbb{N}_\perp)$ proba. distr. over \mathbb{N}_\perp ,

Prog: $\llbracket M \rrbracket : \mathbb{N}_\perp \rightarrow \mathcal{V}(\mathbb{N}_\perp)$,
 $\llbracket \text{let } n=x \text{ in } M \rrbracket : \mathcal{V}(\mathbb{N}_\perp) \rightarrow \mathcal{V}(\mathbb{N}_\perp)$

$$x \mapsto \left(\sum_n \llbracket M \rrbracket_{n,q} x_n \right)_q$$

Type: $|\text{Nat}| = \mathbb{N}$
 $P(\text{Nat})$ subproba. dist. over \mathbb{N}

Prog: $\llbracket M \rrbracket : P(\text{Nat}) \rightarrow P(\text{Nat})$

$$x \mapsto \left(\sum_{\mu=[n_1, \dots, n_k]} \llbracket M \rrbracket_{\mu,q} \prod_{i=1}^k x_{n_i} \right)_q$$

General Framework	Domains Semantics	Quantitative Semantics
Types	Continuous dpos (X, \leq)	Proba. spaces $(X , P(X) \subseteq (\mathbb{R}^+)^{ X })$
Programs	Scott Continuous	Analytic Functions
Probability	Proba. monad	Values as proba. distr.

Problematic in domain

Finding a full subcategory of continuous dpos that is: **Cartesian Closed** and **closed** under the proba. monad \mathcal{V} .

Full Abs.: PCOH/pPCF

Prob $(C[M], \underline{n})$

$\forall n, \underline{\underline{=}} \forall C[]$

Prob $(C[N], \underline{n})$

iff

$\llbracket M \rrbracket = \llbracket N \rrbracket$.

***A denotational semantics to **discrete** probabilistic
higher-order functional computation,
which is **fully abstract*****

(based on **quantitative** semantics)

- ① General framework: Domains vs Quantitative semantics
- ② **PCoh: Probabilistic Coherent Spaces**
- ③ Probabilistic Call by Name
- ④ Probabilistic Call by Push Value

Types as Probabilistic Coherent Spaces: $(|X|, P(X))$

Proba. Space

$|X|$: the **web**, a (potentially infinite) set of final states

$P(X)$: a set of vectors $\subseteq (\mathbb{R}^+)^{|X|}$ such that

closure: $P(X)^{\perp\perp} = P(X)$ with

$$\forall u, v \in (\mathbb{R}^+)^{|X|}, \langle u, v \rangle = \sum_{a \in |X|} u_a v_a$$

$$\forall P \subseteq (\mathbb{R}^+)^{|X|}, P^\perp = \{v \in (\mathbb{R}^+)^{|X|} ; \forall u \in P, \langle u, v \rangle \leq 1\}$$

bounded covering: $\forall a \in |X|,$

$$\exists v \in P(X) ; v_a \neq 0 \quad \text{and} \quad \exists p > 0, ; \forall v \in P(X), v_a \leq p.$$

Proposition: Proba. spaces as Domains

$(|X|, P(X))$ is a **Proba. space** iff $P(X)$ is bounded covering, **Scott Closed** (downwards-closed and dcpo) and **Convex**.

Types as Probabilistic Coherent Spaces: $(|X|, P(X))$

Example

$$|\mathbf{1}| = \{*\} \quad P(\mathbf{1}) = [0, 1]$$

$$|\mathbf{Bool}| = \{t, f\} \quad P(\mathbf{Bool}) = \{(p, q) ; p + q \leq 1\}$$

$$|\mathbf{Nat}| = \{0, 1, 2, \dots\} \quad P(\mathbf{Nat}) = \{x \in [0, 1]^{\mathbb{N}} ; \sum_n x_n \leq 1\}$$

$$|\mathbf{Bool} \Rightarrow \mathbf{1}| = \{[t^n, f^m] ; n, m \in \mathbb{N}\},$$

$$P(\mathbf{Bool} \Rightarrow \mathbf{1}) = \{Q \in (\mathbb{R}^+)^{|\mathbf{Bool} \Rightarrow \mathbf{1}|} ;$$

$$\forall x_t + x_f \leq 1, \sum_{m,n=0}^{\infty} Q_{[t^m, f^n]} x_t^m x_f^n \leq 1\}$$

Proposition: Proba. spaces as Domains

$(|X|, P(X))$ is a **Proba. space** iff $P(X)$ is bounded covering, **Scott Closed** (downwards-closed and dcpo) and **Convex**.

Pcoh : Linear Category

Objects: Proba. Spaces

Morphisms: Linear Functions

Call by Name

$$A \Rightarrow B = !A \multimap B$$

Pcoh_!: Kleisli Category

Objects: Proba. Spaces

Morphisms: Analytic Functions

- **Smcc** ($\mathbf{1}, \otimes, \multimap$)
- biproduct

- **Comonad** ($!, \text{der}, \text{dig}$)
- **Sym. Comonoid** ($!A, \otimes, \mathbf{1}$)

- **CCC**
- (PCF+coin)

$\mathbf{Pcoh}(X, Y)$

Matrices $Q \in (\mathbb{R}^+)^{|X| \times |Y|}$ such that:

$$\forall x \in P(X), Q \cdot x = \left(\sum_{a \in |X|} Q_{a,b} x_a \right)_b \in P(Y)$$

Example

$\mathbf{Pcoh}(\mathbf{Nat}, \mathbf{Nat})$: Stochastic Matrices $Q \in (\mathbb{R}^+)^{\mathbb{N} \times \mathbb{N}}$.

$$\forall x \in (\mathbb{R}^+)^{\mathbb{N}}; \sum_{n \in \mathbb{N}} x_n \leq 1, \sum_{m, n \in \mathbb{N}} Q_{m,n} x_n \leq 1$$

Free Symetric Comonoid and Comonad

Exponential

$!|X| = \mathcal{M}_{\text{fin}}(|X|)$ the set of finite multisets

$$P(!X) = \{x^! ; x \in P(X)\}^{\perp\perp} \text{ where } x^!_{[a_1, \dots, a_n]} = \prod_{i=1}^n x_{a_i}$$

Example

Let $\text{coin}(p) = (p, 1 - p) \in P(\mathbf{Bool})$.

$$\text{coin}(p)^!_{[]} = 1, \quad \text{coin}(p)^!_{[t,t]} = p^2, \quad \text{coin}(p)^!_{[t,f]} = p(1-p), \dots$$

Theorem (2016: Crubillé - Ehrhard - Pagani - T.)

This exponential computes the free symmetric comonoid.

Free Symetric Comonoid and Comonad

Exponential

$!X = \mathcal{M}_{\text{fin}}(|X|)$ the set of finite multisets

$P(!X) = \{x^! ; x \in P(X)\}^{\perp\perp}$ where $x^!_{[a_1, \dots, a_n]} = \prod_{i=1}^n x_{a_i}$

Symmetric Comonoid

Comonad

Cocontr.: $!X \xrightarrow{c^{!X}} !X \otimes !X$

Coweak.: $!X \xrightarrow{w^{!X}} \mathbf{1}$

Comult.: $\text{dig}_{!X} : !!X \rightarrow !X$

Counit: $\text{der}_{!X} : !X \rightarrow X$

Theorem (2016: Crubillé - Ehrhard - Pagani - T.)

This exponential computes the free symmetric comonoid.

$$\mathbf{Pcoh}_!(X, Y) = \mathbf{Pcoh}(!X, Y)$$

Matrices $Q \in (\mathbb{R}^+)^{\mathcal{M}_{\text{fin}}(|X|) \times |Y|}$ such that

$$\forall U \in P(!X), Q \cdot U = \left(\sum_{m \in \mathcal{M}_{\text{fin}}(|X|)} Q_{m,b} U_m \right)_b \in P(Y)$$

Non-Linear Morphisms are **analytic** and **Scott Continuous**.

$$\mathbf{Pcoh}_!(\mathbf{Bool}, \mathbf{1}) = \left\{ Q \in (\mathbb{R}^+)^{|\mathbf{Bool} \Rightarrow \mathbf{1}|} \text{ s.t. } Q_{[t^m, f^n]} \leq \frac{(n+m)^{n+m}}{n^n m^m} \right\}$$

```
let rec f x =
  if x then if x then f x
            else ()
        else if x then ()
            else f x
```

is denoted as

$$\sum_{n,m=0}^{\infty} \frac{(n+m)!}{n! m!} x_t^{2n+1} x_f^{2m+1}$$

$$\mathbf{Pcoh}_!(X, Y) = \mathbf{Pcoh}(!X, Y)$$

Density

Matrices $Q \in (\mathbb{R}^+)^{\mathcal{M}_{\text{fin}}(|X|) \times |Y|}$ such that if $x_m^! = \prod_{a \in m} x_a^{m(a)}$

$$\forall x \in P(X), Q(x) = \left(\sum_{m \in \mathcal{M}_{\text{fin}}(|X|)} Q_{m,b} x_m^! \right)_b \in P(Y)$$

Non-Linear Morphisms are **analytic** and **Scott Continuous**.

$$\mathbf{Pcoh}_!(\mathbf{Bool}, \mathbf{1}) = \left\{ Q \in (\mathbb{R}^+)^{|\mathbf{Bool} \Rightarrow \mathbf{1}|} \text{ s.t. } Q_{[t^m, f^n]} \leq \frac{(n+m)^{n+m}}{n^n m^m} \right\}$$

```
let rec f x =
  if x then if x then f x
            else ()
        else if x then ()
            else f x
```

is denoted as

$$\sum_{n,m=0}^{\infty} \frac{(n+m)!}{n! m!} x_t^{2n+1} x_f^{2m+1}$$

$$\mathbf{Pcoh}_!(X, Y) = \mathbf{Pcoh}(!X, Y)$$

Density

Matrices $Q \in (\mathbb{R}^+)^{\mathcal{M}_{\text{fin}}(|X|) \times |Y|}$ such that if $x_m^! = \prod_{a \in m} x_a^{m(a)}$

$$\forall x \in P(X), Q(x) = \left(\sum_{m \in \mathcal{M}_{\text{fin}}(|X|)} Q_{m,b} x_m^! \right)_b \in P(Y)$$

Non-Linear Morphisms are **analytic** and **Scott Continuous**.

$$\mathbf{Pcoh}_!(\mathbf{Bool}, \mathbf{1}) = \left\{ Q \in (\mathbb{R}^+)^{|\mathbf{Bool} \Rightarrow \mathbf{1}|} \text{ s.t. } Q_{[t^m, f^n]} \leq \frac{(n+m)^{n+m}}{n^n m^m} \right\}$$

```

let rec f x =
  if x then if x then f x
            else ()
        else if x then ()
            else f x
    
```

pb of DEFINABILITY

$$\sum_{n,m=0}^{\infty} \frac{(n+m)!}{n! m!} x_t^{2n+1} x_f^{2m+1}$$

***A denotational semantics to **discrete** probabilistic
higher-order functional computation,
which is **fully abstract*****

(based on **quantitative** semantics)

- ① General framework: Domains vs Quantitative semantics
- ② PCoh: Probabilistic Coherent Spaces
- ③ **Probabilistic Call by Name**
- ④ Probabilistic Call by Push Value

Theorem (2014: Ehrhard - Pagani - T.)

Pcoh

$$\llbracket M \rrbracket = \llbracket N \rrbracket$$

Adequacy



Full Abstraction



pPCF

$$P \simeq_o Q$$

$$\mathbf{Prob}(C[M], ()) \stackrel{\forall C[]}{=} \mathbf{Prob}(C[N], ())$$

Adequacy Lemma (2011: Danos - Ehrhard):

If $\vdash M : \text{nat}$, then $\forall n \in \mathbb{N}, \llbracket M \rrbracket_n = \mathbf{Prob}(M \rightarrow^* n)$.

Key Ingredients of Full Abstraction

- Find **testing terms** that depend only on points of the web.
- Use regularity of **analytic functions**.

How to encode a LasVegas Algorithm?

Input: A $\underline{0}/\underline{1}$ array of length $n \geq 2$ s.t. $\frac{1}{2}$ cells are $\underline{0}$.

0	1	2	3	4	5
<u>0</u>	<u>1</u>	<u>0</u>	<u>1</u>	<u>1</u>	<u>0</u>

$f : 0, 2, 5 \mapsto \underline{0}$
 $1, 3, 4 \mapsto \underline{1}$

Output: Find the index of a cell containing $\underline{0}$.

Caml:

```
let rec LasVegas (f: nat -> nat) (n:nat) =  
  let k = random n in  
  if (f k = 0) then k  
  else LasVegas f n
```

**pPCF:
CBN**

```
fix (λLasVegas(nat⇒nat)⇒nat⇒nat λfnat⇒nat λnnat  
  (λknat if (f k = 0) then k  
  else LasVegas f n) (rand n)
```

How to encode a LasVegas Algorithm?

Input: A $\underline{0}/\underline{1}$ array of length $n \geq 2$ s.t. $\frac{1}{2}$ cells are $\underline{0}$.

0	1	2	3	4	5
<u>0</u>	<u>1</u>	<u>0</u>	<u>1</u>	<u>1</u>	<u>0</u>

$f : 0, 2, 5 \mapsto \underline{0}$
 $1, 3, 4 \mapsto \underline{1}$

Output: Find the index of a cell containing $\underline{0}$.

Caml:
let in
CBV

```
let rec LasVegas (f: nat -> nat) (n:nat) =  
  let k = random n in  
  if (f k = 0) then k  
  else LasVegas f n
```

pPCF:
CBN

```
fix (λLasVegas(nat⇒nat)⇒nat⇒nat λfnat⇒nat λnnat  
  (λknat if (f k = 0) then k  
  else LasVegas f n) (rand n)
```

Storage Operator

```
let k = rand n in if k = 0 then 42 else k
```

Integer in Pcoh: $\llbracket \text{nat} \rrbracket = (\mathbb{N}, P(\text{nat}) = \{(\lambda_n) \mid \sum_n \lambda_n \leq 1\})$

Equipped with a coalgebraic structure in the *linear* Pcoh:

- Cocontraction: $c^{\text{nat}} : \text{nat} \rightarrow \text{nat} \otimes \text{nat}$
- Coweakening: $w^{\text{nat}} : \text{nat} \rightarrow \mathbf{1}$

Bibliography

- 1990 Krivine, Opérateurs de mise en mémoire et Traduction.
- 1999 Levy, Call by Push Value, a subsuming paradigm.
- 2000 Nour, On Storage operator.
- 2016 Curien, Fiore, Munch-Maccagnoni, A Theory of Effects and Resources .

What sem. object to encode Storage Operator.

The Eilenberg Moore Category: $\mathbf{Pcoh}^!$

Coalgebras $P = (\underline{P}, h_P)$ with $\underline{P} \in \mathbf{Pcoh}$ and $h_P \in \mathbf{Pcoh}(\underline{P}, !\underline{P})$:

$$\begin{array}{ccc} \underline{P} & \xrightarrow{h_P} & !\underline{P} \\ & \searrow \text{Id} & \downarrow \text{der}_{\underline{P}} \\ & & \underline{P} \end{array}$$

$$\begin{array}{ccc} \underline{P} & \xrightarrow{h_P} & !\underline{P} \\ h_P \downarrow & & \downarrow \text{dig}_{\underline{P}} \\ !\underline{P} & \xrightarrow{!h_P} & !!\underline{P} \end{array}$$

Coalgebras have a comonoid structure: values can be **stored**.

Types interpreted as coalgebras:

$!X$ by def. of the exp. | \otimes , \oplus and fix preserve coalgebras.

Example

Stream: $S_\phi = \phi \otimes !S_\phi$ | **List:** $\lambda_0 = \mathbf{1} \oplus (\phi \otimes \lambda_0)$

***A denotational semantics to **discrete** probabilistic
higher-order functional computation,
which is **fully abstract*****

(based on **quantitative** semantics)

- ① General framework: Domains vs Quantitative semantics
- ② PCoh: Probabilistic Coherent Spaces
- ③ Probabilistic Call by Name
- ④ **Probabilistic Call by Push Value**

Probabilistic Call By Push Value

Types:

(positive) $\phi, \psi, \dots := \mathbf{1} \mid !\sigma \mid \phi \otimes \psi \mid \phi \oplus \psi \mid \alpha \mid \text{Fix } \alpha \cdot \phi$

(general) $\sigma, \tau \dots := \phi \mid \phi \multimap \sigma$

Values: (positive type)

$V, W \dots := x \mid () \mid M^! \mid (V, W) \mid \text{in}_1 V \mid \text{in}_2 V \mid \text{fold}(V).$

Programs: (general type)

$M, N \dots := x \mid () \mid M^! \mid \text{der}(M) \mid \lambda x^\phi M \mid \langle M \rangle N \mid \text{fix } x^{! \sigma} M$
 $\mid \text{in}_1 M \mid \text{in}_2 M \mid \text{case}(M, x_1 \cdot N_1, x_2 \cdot N_2)$
 $\mid (M, N) \mid \text{pr}_1 M \mid \text{pr}_2 M \mid \text{fold}(M) \mid \text{unfold}(M)$
 $\mid \text{coin}(p), p \in [0, 1] \cap \mathbb{Q}$

Typing context: $\mathcal{P} = (x_1 : \phi_1, \dots, x_k : \phi_k)$

Probabilistic Call By Push Value

Types:

$$\sigma \Rightarrow \tau = !\sigma \multimap \tau$$

(positive) $\phi, \psi, \dots := \mathbf{1} \mid !\sigma \mid \phi \otimes \psi \mid \phi \oplus \psi \mid \alpha \mid \text{Fix } \alpha \cdot \phi$

(general) $\sigma, \tau \dots := \phi \mid \phi \multimap \sigma$

Values:

$V, W \dots := x \mid () \mid M^! \mid (V, W) \mid \text{in}_1 V \mid \text{in}_2 V \mid \text{fold}(V).$

Programs: $\lambda x^\sigma M = \lambda x^{!\sigma} M$ and $(M)N = \langle M \rangle N^!$

$M, N \dots := x \mid () \mid M^! \mid \text{der}(M) \mid \lambda x^\phi M \mid \langle M \rangle N \mid \text{fix } x^{!\sigma} M$
| $\text{in}_1 M \mid \text{in}_2 M \mid \text{case}(M, x_1 \cdot N_1, x_2 \cdot N_2)$
| $(M, N) \mid \text{pr}_1 M \mid \text{pr}_2 M \mid \text{fold}(M) \mid \text{unfold}(M)$
| $\text{coin}(p), p \in [0, 1] \cap \mathbb{Q}$

Typing context: $\mathcal{P} = (x_1 : \phi_1, \dots, x_k : \phi_k)$

Probabilistic Call By Push Value

Types: $\text{nat} = \text{Fix } \alpha \cdot \mathbf{1} \oplus \alpha$ and $\sigma \Rightarrow \tau = !\sigma \multimap \tau$

(positive) $\phi, \psi, \dots := \mathbf{1} \mid !\sigma \mid \phi \otimes \psi \mid \phi \oplus \psi \mid \alpha \mid \text{Fix } \alpha \cdot \phi$

(general) $\sigma, \tau \dots := \phi \mid \phi \multimap \sigma$

Values: $\underline{0} = \text{in}_1()$ and $\underline{n+1} = \text{in}_2 n$

$V, W \dots := x \mid () \mid M^! \mid (V, W) \mid \text{in}_1 V \mid \text{in}_2 V \mid \text{fold}(V).$

Programs: $\text{succ}(M) = \text{in}_2 M$

$M, N \dots := x \mid () \mid M^! \mid \text{der}(M) \mid \lambda x^\phi M \mid \langle M \rangle N \mid \text{fix } x^{! \sigma} M$
 $\mid \text{in}_1 M \mid \text{in}_2 M \mid \text{case}(M, x_1 \cdot N_1, x_2 \cdot N_2)$
 $\mid (M, N) \mid \text{pr}_1 M \mid \text{pr}_2 M \mid \text{fold}(M) \mid \text{unfold}(M)$
 $\mid \text{coin}(p), p \in [0, 1] \cap \mathbb{Q}$

Typing context: $\mathcal{P} = (x_1 : \phi_1, \dots, x_k : \phi_k)$

Probabilistic Call By Push Value

Types: $\text{nat} = \text{Fix } \alpha \cdot \mathbf{1} \oplus \alpha$ and $\sigma \Rightarrow \tau = !\sigma \multimap \tau$

(positive) $\phi, \psi, \dots := \mathbf{1} \mid !\sigma \mid \phi \otimes \psi \mid \phi \oplus \psi \mid \alpha \mid \text{Fix } \alpha \cdot \phi$

(general) $\sigma, \tau \dots := \phi \mid \phi \multimap \sigma$

Values: $\underline{0} = \text{in}_1()$ and $\underline{n+1} = \text{in}_2 n$

$V, W \dots := x \mid () \mid M^! \mid (V, W) \mid \text{in}_1 V \mid \text{in}_2 V \mid \text{fold}(V).$

Programs: $\text{let } x = M \text{ in } N = \text{case}(M, y \cdot N[\underline{0}/x], z \cdot N[\text{succ}(z)/x])$

$M, N \dots := x \mid () \mid M^! \mid \text{der}(M) \mid \lambda x^\phi M \mid \langle M \rangle N \mid \text{fix } x^{! \sigma} M$
 $\mid \text{in}_1 M \mid \text{in}_2 M \mid \text{case}(M, x_1 \cdot N_1, x_2 \cdot N_2)$
 $\mid (M, N) \mid \text{pr}_1 M \mid \text{pr}_2 M \mid \text{fold}(M) \mid \text{unfold}(M)$
 $\mid \text{coin}(p), p \in [0, 1] \cap \mathbb{Q}$

Typing context: $\mathcal{P} = (x_1 : \phi_1, \dots, x_k : \phi_k)$

Theorem (2016: Ehrhard - T.)

Pcoh

$$\llbracket M \rrbracket = \llbracket N \rrbracket$$

Adequacy



Full Abstraction

pCBPV

$$P \simeq_o Q$$

$$\text{Prob}(C[M], ()) \stackrel{\forall C[]}{=} \text{Prob}(C[N], ())$$

Key Ingredients of Adequacy:

- Handle **values** separately
- Logical relations: **fixpoint** of types (hidden step indexing, biorthogonality closure, fixpoints of pairs of logical relations)
- **Density**: Morphisms on positive types are characterized by their action on coalgebraic points.

Key Ingredients of Full Abstraction:

- Find **testing terms** that depend only on points of the web.
- Use regularity of **analytic functions** and **density**

pCBPV a funct. lang. suitable for writing proba. programs

- Combines CBN and CBV
- Values are of positive Types, they can be duplicated or erased accordingly to the comonoidal structure of their interpretation
- Programs can handle base types such as streams
- Full abstraction (with no quotient needed)

Further directions:

- Combine Non-determinism and Probability by constructing a non-deterministic monad on \mathbf{Pcoh}_I .
- Move up from discrete to continuous probability.